



U.S. Department
of Transportation
**Federal Transit
Administration**

REGION X
Alaska, Idaho, Oregon,
Washington

915 Second Avenue
Federal Bldg. Suite 3142
Seattle, WA 98174-1002
206-220-7954
206-220-7959 (fax)

November 7, 2014

Mr. Bruce Warner
President, Board of Directors
Office of the General Manager
Tri-Met
1800 SW 1st Avenue
Portland, Oregon 97201

Re: Federal Transit Administration FY 2014 Triennial Review – Final Report

Dear Mr. Warner:

This report documents the Federal Transit Administration's (FTA) Triennial Review of Tri-Met, in Portland, Oregon. This review is required by Chapter 53 of Title 49, United States Code, Section 5307. Although less exacting than an audit, the Triennial Review is the FTA's assessment of Tri-Met's compliance with Federal requirements, determined by examining a sample of grant management and program implementation practices. As such, the Triennial Review is not intended as, nor does it constitute, a comprehensive and final review of compliance with grant requirements.

The Triennial Review focused on Tri-Met's compliance in 17 areas. No deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements in 15 areas. Deficiencies were found in two areas: ADA, and DBE. Tri-Met had no repeat deficiencies from the 2011 Triennial Review.

FTA Region 10 acknowledges receipt of Tri-Met's timely response to the draft report. We appreciate the diligence of staff in following up on the Triennial Review. Two letters, dated September 19 and October 22, 2014, provided additional documentation relevant to the deficiencies found during the review. FTA will require additional time to review and complete its assessment of Tri-Met's response in order to close findings.

Please extend our appreciation to all staff for the cooperation and assistance during this Triennial Review. If TriMet staff needs any technical assistance or has any questions, please do not hesitate to contact Thomas Radmilovich, FTA Program Manager, at 206.220.7954 or thomas.radmilovich@dot.gov.

Sincerely,

R.F. Krochalis
Regional Administrator

Encl: 2014 Triennial Review

Electronic cc: Neil McFarlane, GM, TriMet

100



FINAL REPORT

FY2014 TRIENNIAL REVIEW

of the

**Tri-County Metropolitan Transportation District of Oregon
Tri-Met
Portland, Oregon
Recipient ID: 1728**

Performed for:

**U.S. DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION
FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION
REGION X**

Prepared by:

Interactive Elements, Inc.

**Scoping Meeting Date: June 4, 2014
Site Visit Dates: September 8-10, 2014
Final Report Date: November 7, 2014**

Table of Contents

I. Executive Summary	1
II. Review Background and Process	2
1. Background	2
2. Process.....	2
3. Metrics.....	2
III. Grantee Description.....	4
IV. Results of the Review	8
1. Financial Management and Financial Capacity	8
2. Technical Capacity	8
3. Maintenance.....	8
4. Americans with Disabilities Act.....	8
5. Title VI	9
6. Procurement	10
7. Disadvantaged Business Enterprise.....	10
8. Legal.....	11
9. Satisfactory Continuing Control	12
10. Planning/Program of Projects.....	12
11. Public Comment on Fare Increases and Major Service Reductions.....	12
12. Half Fare	12
13. Charter Bus.....	12
14. School Bus	13
15. Safety and Security	13
16. Drug Free Workplace and Drug and Alcohol Program	13
17. Equal Employment Opportunities.....	13
V. Summary of Findings.....	15
VI. Attendees.....	17

I. Executive Summary

This report documents the Federal Transit Administration's (FTA) Triennial Review of Tri-Met. The review was performed by Interactive Elements, Inc. During the site visit, administrative and statutory requirements were discussed and documents were reviewed. Tri-Met's transit facilities were toured to provide an overview of activities related to FTA-funded projects.

The Triennial Review focused on Tri-Met's compliance in 17 areas. Deficiencies were found in the areas listed below.

Review Area	Deficiencies	
	Code	Description
ADA	306	Insufficient oversight of ADA requirements (Maintenance requirements)
DBE	548	DBE goal submission not complete
	329	Lacking procedures for reporting contracts on Semi-Annual Report

II. Review Background and Process

1. Background

The United States Code, Chapter 53 of Title 49, requires the FTA of the United States Department of Transportation (USDOT) to perform reviews and evaluations of Urbanized Area Formula Grant activities at least every three years. This requirement is contained in 49 U.S.C. 5307(i). This review was performed in accordance with FTA procedures (published in FTA Order 9010.1B, April 5, 1993). At least once every three years, the Secretary shall review and evaluate completely the performance of a grantee in carrying out its program, specifically referring to compliance with statutory and administrative requirements.

The Triennial Review includes a review of the grantee's compliance in 17 areas. The basic requirements for each of these areas are summarized in Section IV.

This report presents the findings from the Triennial Review of Tri-Met. The review concentrated on procedures and practices employed during the past three years; however, coverage was extended to earlier periods as needed to assess the policies in place and the management of grants. The specific documents reviewed are referenced in this report and are available at FTA's Regional Office or at the grantee's office.

2. Process

The Triennial Review process includes a pre-review assessment, a review scoping meeting with the FTA regional office, and an on-site visit to the grantee's location. The review scoping meeting was conducted with the Region X Office on June 4, 2014. As a result of the meeting, three Enhanced Review Modules were added to the baseline review, in the areas of Maintenance, Title VI, and DBE. Necessary files retained by the regional office were sent to the reviewer electronically. A review package was sent to Tri-Met advising it of the site visit and indicating information that would be needed and issues that would be discussed. The site visit to Tri-Met occurred on September 8-10, 2014.

The onsite portion of the review began with an entrance conference, in which the purpose of the Triennial Review and the review process were discussed. The remaining time was spent discussing administrative and statutory requirements and reviewing documents. A tour of Tri-Met's transit facilities was conducted to provide an overview of activities related to FTA-funded projects. A sample of maintenance records for FTA-funded vehicles and equipment was also examined during the site visit. Upon completion of the review, a summary of preliminary findings was provided to Tri-Met at an exit conference. The individuals participating in the review are listed in Section VI of this report.

3. Metrics

The metrics used to evaluate whether a grantee is meeting the requirements for each of the areas reviewed are:

- *Not Deficient*: An area is considered not deficient if, during the review, no findings were noted with the grantee's implementation of the requirements.
- *Deficient*: An area is considered deficient if all of the requirements within the area reviewed were not met.
- *Not Applicable*: An area can be deemed not applicable if, after an initial assessment, the grantee does not conduct activities for which the requirements of the respective area would be applicable.

III. Grantee Description

The Tri-County Metropolitan Transportation District of Oregon (Tri-Met) provides public transit service in Portland, Oregon and the surrounding area, including portions of Multnomah, Clackamas, and Washington Counties. Tri-Met was established in 1969 by the Oregon Legislature as a mass transit district and is governed by a board of seven directors appointed by the Governor. The population of the service area is 1,489,796 people.

Tri-Met directly operates fixed route bus service, provides complementary paratransit service, and operates a light rail system seven days a week, from 4:30 am until 2:30 am. A commuter rail service operates weekdays only, from 5:20 am to 10:00 am and from 3:30 pm to 8:00 pm.

Fixed route bus service is provided on 79 routes, utilizing a fleet of 625 federally funded buses. Paratransit service, known locally as LIFT, is operated by two contractors, First Transit and Green Transportation, with a fleet of 268 vehicles, funded by FTA and the state. Broadway Cab operates a fleet of 45 vehicles to supplement paratransit service.

The light rail system, known as MAX, comprises a fleet of 127 cars operating on 5 lines, covering 52.6 miles and including 85 stations. The commuter rail line, known as WES, utilizes four federally funded vehicles and two locally funded vehicles, operates on a 14.7 mile route, and includes five stations.

The basic adult fare for all Tri-Met lines is \$2.50. Honored Citizens, those who are 65 or older, disabled or presenting a Medicare card, pay \$1.00, and LIFT paratransit service is \$2.50.

Tri-Met contracts with 17 firms to support its operations and maintenance, and has eight subrecipients receiving federal JARC funds and two municipalities that are subrecipients of federal funds.

Tri-Met has four bus garages: Center Street Bus Maintenance, Powell Operations Facility, and ATP/LIFT in Portland, and Merlo Operations Facility in Beaverton. There are three rail facilities: Ruby Junction in Gresham, Elmonica in Beaverton, and Wilsonville Commuter Rail Facility in Wilsonville. There are seventeen transit centers, and administrative functions are located at two sites, at Center Street and at Harrison Square.

Tri-Met's National Transit Database Report for FY2012 provided the following financial and operating statistics for its fixed-route and paratransit service:

	Fixed-Route Bus Service	Paratransit Service	Light Rail Service
Unlinked Passenger trips	59,509,235	946,005	42,227,665
Vehicle Revenue Miles	19,169,232	6,574,706	7,744,290
Operating Expenses	\$230,726,059	\$31,194,438	\$99,710,015

Below is a list of Tri-Met's active grants at the time of the review.

Grant Number	Grant Amount	Year Executed	Description
OR-03-1125	\$75,000	2010	Portland Streetcar Loop Project
OR-03-126	\$279,510,942	2014	Milwaukie Light Rail Project
OR-04-0033	\$4,000,000	2013	Construct Administration Building
OR-04-0040	\$330,728	2012	Veterans Transportation
OR-16-x042	\$2,314,499	2014	Elderly/Disabled
OR-26-0005	\$49,643	2012	Veterans Transportation
OR-26-7001	\$6,390,000	2010	Portland streetcar Prototype
OR-34-0001	\$5,495,323	2014	Bus Purchase
OR-37-x009	\$4,533,889	2013	JARC
OR-54-0001	\$35,034,009	2014	Rail and Bus Preventive Maintenance
OR-57-x002	\$2,747,148	2012	New Freedom
OR-58-0002	\$2,500,000	2012	Purchase four replacement buses
OR-88-0001	\$4,200,000	2011	TIGGER, LRT energy storage units
OR-90-x147	\$100,438,636	2011	Preventive Maintenance and Transit Enhancement
OR-90-x159	\$34,580,799	2013	Preventive Maintenance and Transit Enhancement
OR-90-x166	\$70,639,156	2014	Preventive Maintenance and Transit Enhancement
OR-95-x008	\$7,322,532	2010	CMAQ, Bus stop development
OR-95-x038	\$1,301,085	2014	Regional Transportation Options
OR-95-x040	\$1,000,000	2013	Tacoma Street Pedestrian Ramp
OR-95-x044	\$1,200,000	2013	Pedestrian Bridge under Kellogg Lake Light Rail Bridge
OR-95-x053	\$19,200,000	2014	CMAQ, Debt Service and Preventive Maintenance
OR-95-x054	\$18,835,500	2014	Bus Preventive Maintenance

All ARRA-funded projects were completed and drawn down by 5/18/2012. The following three projects were completed between 10/1/2011 and 5/18/2012:

Preventive Maintenance (two ARRA Projects): This project included the labor and materials/services used for the on-going maintenance of the light rail fleet.

Bike Stations: The project included replacement of bicycle lockers at 15 locations; the design and construction of two new bicycle parking facilities at Beaverton Transit Center and Sunset Transit Center and CCTV cameras at an existing bicycle parking facility at Gresham Garage as well as the Beaverton and Sunset bike facilities.

The bicycle stations project was located at light rail stations and Transit Centers in Multnomah and Washington Counties. Approximately 50 new stainless steel bicycle locker units that accommodate 100 bicycles total were procured and installed to replace existing fiberglass units at approximately 15 light rail stations and Transit Centers. Design and construction of new facilities included a bicycle parking structure at the Beaverton Transit Center and a bicycle parking cage within an existing parking garage at the Sunset Transit Center. The existing

Gresham Central Transit Center Garage bicycle parking cage was upgraded with new secured access gate system and CCTV cameras. Both new and upgraded facilities will store a total of 200 bicycles in fully enclosed facilities with bicycle racks and CCTV cameras.

Portland Streetcar Signals: This project included two new signals, ADA curb ramps and ITS signage at stations for the Portland Streetcar Loop project. The new signals were installed on NE 2nd and Broadway and NE 2nd and Weidler and featured phasing to accommodate streetcar service, and included modifications to hardware and software. Curb ramps were fully compliant with ADA regulations, including tactile warning areas. The ramps and signage were part of station and/or street improvements. The ramps included ADA-compliant slopes with tactile warning areas that met federal standards at affected intersection and stations; and they replaced existing concrete.

In addition to the ARRA funded projects, the Portland Streetcar Loop Project was completed during the past three years. Tri-Met entered into a Project Construction Grant Agreement (FFGA) with the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) in October 2009. The project included design and construction of a 3.3-mile extension of the existing Portland streetcar system with 28 new designated stops. The new alignment extends the streetcar tracks, stations and service between downtown Portland's Pearl District, across the existing Broadway Bridge, through the Rose Quarter, the Lloyd District, and the Central Eastside to the OMSI District in southeast Portland. The project also serves the Martin Luther King, Jr Blvd-Grand Ave corridor and the Oregon Convention Center. Improvements and expansion of the streetcar's maintenance and operations facility were also included in the project; traction electrification, an overhead catenary system, traffic signals and streetlights were installed. The City of Portland was the subgrantee and managed the construction and operations of the Portland Streetcar Loop Project. FTA New Starts funding for the project was \$75 million. The City of Portland secured commitments for the remainder of the capital cost of the project. Revenue service commenced September 2012. Remaining work includes the Before-and-After study.

Construction of the Milwaukie Light Rail Project is on-going. Tri-Met entered into a Full Funding Grant Agreement (FFGA) with the Federal Transit Administration in May 2012. Funding partners include FTA, Clackamas County, Metro, City of Milwaukie, the Oregon Department of Transportation (ODOT), and the City of Portland. Oregon Health Sciences University (OHSU) and private parties donated property. The 7.3 mile project totals \$1.4 billion. It will connect the Portland Central City and Portland State University with high density residential neighborhoods in the South Auditorium area, River Place and the South Waterfront. The South Waterfront is home to the OHSU Schnitzer Medical School campus with approximately 4 million new square feet of office and treatment facilities. A bridge across the Willamette River will provide access for light rail, buses, streetcar, bicycles and pedestrians to the Portland Aerial Tram that provides a 90 second ride to 11,000 jobs on the Marquam Hill Campus and to the OMSI District on the east side of the Willamette River. The project will extend through SE Portland's residential areas to the City of Milwaukie and will provide over 675 park and ride spaces. The project includes 18 new light rail vehicles, improvements and expansion to the Ruby Junction maintenance facility, improvements to the Center Street administrative building, traction electrification, overhead catenary system, communications, central control, fare collection and signal systems. The project will commence revenue service in September 2015.

Projects being planned for the next three to five years include the Powell/Division Bus Rapid Transit Project and the Southwest Corridor Project.

The Powell-Division Transit and Development Project is a community-based effort to bring a new regional transit investment to Southeast Portland, East Portland and Gresham that can be built in five to seven years. The public conversation, through spring 2015, will center on transit alternatives – the vehicle type, its route and station locations – as well as strategies for community development at future station areas.

The Southwest Corridor Plan coordinates land use and transportation planning efforts to develop an investment strategy that identifies and prioritizes needed projects to serve locally desired land uses and stimulate community and economic development. This transit project will study transit alternatives along Highway 99, which runs generally north to south between Portland and Tualatin, their potential impact on traffic, the environment and communities. The plan incorporates existing local land use visions, such as the Barbur Concept Plan, the Tigard High Capacity Transit Land Use Plan, Linking Tualatin and the Sherwood Town Center Plan. In July 2013, the Southwest Corridor Plan Steering Committee recommended a shared investment strategy, identifying key investments in roadways, active transportation, parks, trails and nature as well as options for transit to be studied further. The plan is currently in a refinement phase for a potential high capacity transit connection between Portland, Tigard and Tualatin.

IV. Results of the Review

1. Financial Management and Financial Capacity

Basic Requirement: The grantee must demonstrate the ability to match and manage FTA grant funds, cover cost increases and operating deficits, cover maintenance and operational costs for FTA funded facilities and equipment, as well as conduct and respond to applicable audits.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Financial Management and Financial Capacity.

2. Technical Capacity

Basic Requirement: The grantee must be able to implement FTA funded projects in accordance with the grant application, Master Agreement, and all applicable laws and regulations, using sound management practices.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Technical Capacity.

3. Maintenance

Basic Requirement: Grantees and subrecipients must keep federally funded vehicles, equipment and facilities in good operating condition. Grantees and subrecipients must keep ADA accessibility features on all vehicles, equipment and facilities in good operating order.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Maintenance.

4. Americans with Disabilities Act

Basic Requirement: Titles II and III of the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (ADA) provide that no entity shall discriminate against an individual with a disability in connection with the provision of transportation service. The law sets forth specific requirements for vehicle and facility accessibility and the provision of service, including complementary paratransit service.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, deficiencies were found with the USDOT requirements for ADA. Tri-Met does not provide adequate oversight of its paratransit maintenance contractor.

Tri-Met contracts with Penske Truck Leasing, Co., LP paratransit vehicle maintenance. A review of Tri-Met's April 2014 Tri-Met Fleet Management Plan (FMP) noted an absence of preventive maintenance checklists for the fleet of vehicles. The paratransit program, known as LIFT, uses a fleet that contains a mixture of vehicle types. Considering that these vehicles differ in manufacturing date (2006 to 2012), manufacturer (Ford, Chevy, Dodge), engine size, and type

of transmission, grantees must ensure that preventive maintenance is performed in accordance with the minimum standards established by the OEM.

A review of the contract between Tri-Met and Penske noted inconsistent maintenance requirements from those found in Tri-Met's FMP. The FMP initially required oil changes to be conducted at 6,000 miles. However, the FMP also noted that after conducting an oil analysis, oil changes must begin at 3,000 miles due to the type of service these vehicles performed. The contract between Tri-Met and Penske stated oil changes were to be at 6,000 miles.

In addition, the contract only required two service intervals for preventive maintenance: A and B. However, it is well established in the transit industry that these vehicles require preventive maintenance functions beyond the A- and B-intervals.

Further, neither document addressed the maintenance requirements for maintaining the CAD/AVL system which includes voice and data communications, automated vehicle location, and covert alarms. In addition, information was lacking as to the requirements for the LIFT warranty program, contractor requirements, and how Tri-Met provided oversight of the warranty program.

Corrective Actions and Schedules: By January 16, 2015, Tri-Met is to prepare and submit to the FTA Region 10 Office:

- Updated maintenance plan addressing current fleet information and requirements for preventive maintenance that are consistent with manufacturer's recommendations; warranty program, and maintenance requirements for ADA-related accessibility features
- Justification if preventive maintenance is not performed in accordance with OEM requirements (e.g. use of synthetic oil extends PMs by a certain percentage)
- Evidence that the updated maintenance requirements are communicated to the contractor
- Oversight procedures

Subsequent to the site visit, Tri-Met revised its Bus Fleet Maintenance Plan to include additional information, checklists, and performance measures for the LIFT fleet. Supplementary summary material showed the manufacturer's recommended procedure as compared to Tri-Met practices. However, in order to close this finding, Tri-Met needs to provide oversight procedures and evidence that the requirements and procedures have been communicated to the contractor.

5. Title VI

Basic Requirement: The grantee must ensure that no person shall, on the grounds of race, color, or national origin, be excluded from participating in, or be denied the benefits of, or be subject to discrimination under any program or activity receiving federal financial assistance without regard to whether specific projects or services are federally funded. The grantee must ensure that federally supported transit services and related benefits are distributed in an equitable manner.

Note: The 2014 Triennial Review covers a three-year period in which the FTA issued a revised circular for Title VI, which provided more information on how to comply and changed

requirements for some grantees with populations over 200,000 persons. As of October 1, 2012, grantees must comply with the requirements of FTA C 4702.1B. The Triennial Review will look at compliance with the requirement of FTA C 4702.1A for the period prior to October 1, 2012, and compliance with the revised circular for activities after this date.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Title VI. Procurement

6. Procurement

Basic Requirement: Grantees use their own procurement procedures that reflect applicable state and local laws and regulations, provided that the process ensures competitive procurement and the procedures conform to applicable federal law, including 49 CFR Part 18 (specifically Section 18.36) and FTA Circular 4220.1F, “Third Party Contracting Guidance.”

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Procurement.

7. Disadvantaged Business Enterprise

Basic Requirement: The grantee must comply with 49 CFR Part 26 to ensure nondiscrimination in the award and administration of DOT-assisted contracts. Grantees also must create a level playing field on which DBEs can compete fairly for DOT-assisted contracts.

FTA’s Office of Civil Rights utilized this Triennial Review to resolve DBE Complaint No. 2014-0189 as follows:

- Review awards and payments made, as reported in the Semi-annual Uniform Reports, to DBE and non-DBE firms from 2010-2013. Request documents verifying the award and payment amounts and compare this information to the data submitted in Uniform Reports from 2010-2013.
- Review grantee’s process for determining a DBE’s commercially useful function (CUF) for counting purposes
- Determine grantee’s role(s)/function within the UCP and assess whether it is performing those functions.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, deficiencies were found with the USDOT requirements for DBE.

No. 1: The process Tri-Met uses to identify contracting opportunities limits the ability to fully identify all contracting opportunities and limits the full use of the North American Industry Classification System (NAIC).

According to Tri-Met's Shortfall Analysis for October 1, 2012 to September 30, 2013, Tri-Met identifies contracting opportunities when contract specifications and scopes of work are submitted to the Procurement Office. During the site visit, TriMet's Office of Diversity and Transit Equity confirmed this was the current process used.

A discussion was held wherein the reviewer used a construction project as example to show that opportunities exist well before design and actual construction. In order to understand the dynamics of a construction project, it was important for the Office to "be at the table" early in the inception/strategic planning process. This would then enable the Office to begin to understand the project scope and associated potential contracting opportunities earlier in the process. Waiting until project scopes were defined to the point of procuring services can potentially leave out many opportunities to be captured for goal-setting purposes.

Corrective Actions and Schedules:

- By April 10, 2015, Tri-Met is to develop and submit to the FTA Region 10 Civil Rights Officer a policy that identifies how contracting opportunities are developed. The Policy is to identify the Office to which the authority to implement policy requirements has been delegated, procedures describing the methodology used for identifying contracting opportunities, and how Tri-Met determines the applicable NAICS codes.
- By April 30, 2015, Tri-Met is to contact the FTA Region 10 Civil Rights Officer in writing to discuss whether or not FY14-FY17 contracting goals should be resubmitted. Tri-Met is to then follow direction given by the Civil Rights Officer.

No. 2: During the site visit, it could not be determined what methodology Tri-Met used to report prime contracts awarded and contracts closed on the Semi-Annual Report. Tri-Met reported awarding 826 prime contracts since 2011 and as of August 8, 2014, only 29 contracts were reported as closed.

Corrective Action and Schedule: By January 9, 2015, Tri-Met is to provide the Region 10 Civil Rights Officer with a description of the methodology used to report awarded contracts.

8. Legal

Basic Requirement: The grantee must be eligible and authorized under state and local law to request, receive, and dispense FTA funds and to execute and administer FTA funded projects. The authority to take actions and responsibility on behalf of the grantee must be properly delegated and executed. Grantees must comply with Restrictions on Lobbying requirements.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Legal.

9. Satisfactory Continuing Control

Basic Requirement: The grantee must ensure that FTA-funded property will remain available to be used for its originally authorized purpose throughout its useful life until disposition.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Satisfactory Continuing Control.

10. Planning/Program of Projects

Basic Requirement: The grantee must participate in the transportation planning process in accordance with FTA requirements, MAP-21, and the metropolitan and statewide planning regulations. Grantees must participate in a coordinated public transit-human services transportation planning process that identifies the transportation needs of individuals with disabilities, older adults, and people with low incomes; provides strategies for meeting those local needs; and prioritizes transportation services for funding and implementation. Each recipient of a Section 5307 grant shall develop, publish, afford an opportunity for a public hearing on, and submit for approval, a POP.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Planning/POP.

11. Public Comment on Fare Increases and Major Service Reductions

Basic Requirement: Section 5307 grantees are expected to have a written, locally developed process for soliciting and considering public comment before raising a fare or carrying out a major transportation service reduction.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Public Comment on Fare Increases and Major Service Reductions.

12. Half Fare

Basic Requirement: For service supported with Section 5307 assistance, fares charged elderly persons, persons with disabilities or an individual presenting a Medicare card during off peak hours will not be more than one half the peak hour fares.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Half Fare.

13. Charter Bus

Basic Requirement: Grantees are prohibited from using federally funded equipment and facilities to provide charter service if a registered private charter operator expresses interest in providing

the service. Grantees are allowed to operate community based charter services excepted under the regulations.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Charter Bus.

14. School Bus

Basic Requirement: Grantees are prohibited from providing exclusive school bus service unless the service qualifies and is approved by the FTA Administrator under an allowable exemption. Federally funded equipment or facilities cannot be used to provide exclusive school bus service. School tripper service that operates and looks like all other regular service is allowed.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for School Bus.

15. Safety and Security

Basic Requirement: As recipients of Section 5307 funds, grantees must annually certify that they are spending at least one percent of such funds for transit security projects or that such expenditures for security systems are not necessary.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Security.

16. Drug Free Workplace and Drug and Alcohol Program

Basic Requirement: All grantees are required to maintain a drug-free workplace for all employees and to have an ongoing drug-free awareness program. Grantees receiving Section 5307, 5309 or 5311 funds that have safety-sensitive employees must have a drug and alcohol testing program in place for such employees.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Drug-Free Workplace and Drug and Alcohol Program.

17. Equal Employment Opportunities

Basic Requirement: The grantee must ensure that no person in the United States shall on the grounds of race, color, religion, national origin, sex, age, or disability be excluded from participating in, or denied the benefits of, or be subject to discrimination in employment under any project, program, or activity receiving federal financial assistance under the federal transit laws. (Note: EEOC's regulation only identifies/recognizes religion and not creed as one of the protected groups.)

Finding: During this Triennial Review of Tri-Met, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO).

V. Summary of Findings

Review Area	Finding	Deficiency	Corrective Action	Response Date	Date Closed
1. Financial Management and Financial Capacity	ND				
2. Technical Capacity	ND				
3. Maintenance	ND				
4. ADA	D:306	Insufficient oversight of ADA requirements	<p>Tri-Met is to prepare and submit to the FTA Region 10 Office:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Updated maintenance plan addressing current fleet information and requirements for preventive maintenance that are consistent with manufacturer's recommendations; warranty program, and maintenance requirements for ADA-related accessibility features • Justification if preventive maintenance is not performed in accordance with OEM requirements (e.g. use of synthetic oil extends PMs by a certain percentage) • Evidence that the updated maintenance requirements are communicated to the contractor • Oversight procedures 	1/16/15	
5. Title VI	ND				
6. Procurement	ND				

Review Area	Finding	Deficiency	Corrective Action	Response Date	Date Closed
6. DBE	548	DBE Goal submission not complete	Tri-Met is to develop and submit to the FTA Region 10 Civil Rights Officer:	4/10/15	
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A policy that identifies how contracting opportunities are developed. The Policy is to identify the Office delegated the authority to carry policy requirements, procedures describing the processes used for identifying contracting opportunities, and how Tri-Met determines the applicable NAICS codes Tri-Met is to contact the FTA Region 10 Civil Rights Officer in writing to discuss whether or not FY14-FY17 contracting goals should be resubmitted. Tri-Met is to then follow direction given by the Civil Rights Officer. 	4/30/15	
	329	DBE uniform reports do not include required information	Tri-Met is to provide the Region 10 Civil Rights Officer with a description of the methodology used to report awarded contracts.	1/9/15	
8. Legal	ND				
9. Satisfactory Continuing Control	ND				
10. Planning/ POP	ND				
11. Public Comment on Fare Increase and Major Service Reductions	ND				
13. Half Fare	ND				
13. Charter Bus	ND				
14. School Bus	ND				
15. Safety and Security	ND				
16. Drug-Free Workplace/ Drug and Alcohol Program	ND				
17. EEO	ND				

VI. Attendees

Name	Title/Organization	Phone Number	E-mail Address
<i>Tri-Met</i>			
Kerry Ayres-Palanuk	Service Planning Manager	503 962 7520	palanukk@trimet.org
Lori Baker	Director and Controller	503 962 4817	bakerl@trimet.org
Jackie Blyn	Contract Administrator	503 962 2218	blynj@trimet.org
Sandy Bradley	Program Management	503 962 2132	bradleys@trimet.org
Dee Brookshire	Exec. Director, Finance and Administration	503 962 4822	brookshd@trimet.org
Angela Burns-Brown	HR Administration	503 962 2252	browna@trimet.org
Dan Caufield	Director, Operations Planning and Development	503 962 4803	caufield@trimet.org
Michael Dohn	Senior Budget and Forecasting Analyst	503 962 4809	dohnm@trimet.org
Susan Florentino	Manager LIFT Service Delivery	503 962 8203	florents@trimet.org
Meshawn Flowers	Financial Accountant	503 962 5648	flowersm@trimet.org
Jim Fronk	Contract Administrator	503 962 4953	fronkj@trimet.org
Darlene Gastineau	Manager, Internal Audit	503 962 5611	gastined@trimet.org
H. Elizabeth Goebel	Senior Deputy General Counsel	503 962 4808	goebell@trimet.org
Monika Johnson	Diversity and Transit Equity Office	503 962 2213	johnsomo@trimet.org
Debora Leopold Hutchins	Manager, Insurance Programs	503 962 2267	leopoldd@trimet.org
Alison Langton	Senior Financial Analyst	503 962 5850	langtona@trimet.org
Alan Lehto	Director Planning and Policy	503 962 2136	lehtoa@trimet.org
Shelly Lomax	Executive Director, Transportation	503 962 4982	lomaxs@trimet.org
Dan Marchand	Planner	503 962 5839	marchand@trimet.org
Martin Martinez Gonzalez	Manager Multicultural Programs	503 962 5813	gonzalem@trimet.org
Sam Marra	Executive Director, Maintenance Operations	503 962 5840	marras@trimet.org
Kurtis McCoy	Maintenance Analyst	503 962 5885	mccoys@trimet.org
Kathy Miller	Manager LIFT Eligibility	503 962 8209	millerk@trimet.org
Allen Morgan	Manager, Operations Training	503 9624854	morgana@trimet.org
Robert T. Nelson	Deputy General Manager	503 962 4955	nelsonr@trimet.org
Claire Potter	Director, Budget, Financial Analysis	503 962 5867	potterc@trimet.org
Julie Ratcliff	Grant Compliance Analyst	503 962 4819	ratclifj@trimet.org
Hannah Ritchie	Service Planner	503 962 4912	ritchieh@trimet.org

Harry Saporta	Executive Director, Safety and Security	503 962 4909	saportah@trimet.org
Robert Seeley	Manager, Bus Maintenance	503 962 5830	seeleyb@trimet.org
Nick Stewart	Manager, Real Property	503 962 2204	stewartn@trimet.org
Tom Strader	Senior Fare Policy Program Coordinator	503 962 6424	stradert@trimet.org
David Trimble	Director, Transportation Programs	503 962 4984	trimbled@trimet.org
Jake Warr	Policy Advisor Diversity and Transit Equity	503 962 2234	warrj@trimet.org
Kimarie Webber	Analyst	503 962 3035	webberk@trimet.org
Pam Wilson	Manager, Marketing and Outreach	503 962 6434	wilsonp@trimet.org
Brian Woodall	Contracts Manager	503 962 3055	woodallb@trimet.org
Johnell McArthur Bell	Director of Diversity & Transit Equity	503 962 2217	BellJ@TriMet.org
<i>FTA Region X</i>			
Steve Saxton	Program Manager	206 220 4311	james.saxton@dot.gov
Tom Radmilovich	Community Planner	206 220 7954	thomas.radmilovich@dot.gov
Rick Krochalis	Regional Administrator	206 220 7957	richard.krochalis@dot.gov
<i>Interactive Elements, Inc.</i>			
Maxine Finkelstein	Reviewer	212 490 9090	mxmf@ieitransit.com
Susan Gilbert	Reviewer	212 490 9090	sbg@ieitransit.com
Laurie Heinze	Reviewer	770 843 6006	lmh@ieitransit.com
Dennis Newman	Reviewer	732 901 0110	drn@ieitransit.com